

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>9</b>
1.1	Purpose of the Committee of Inquiry (the Committee) .....	9
1.1.1	Government commitments .....	9
1.1.2	Findings of the inter-departmental task team reporting in 1999 .....	9
1.2	Terms of reference .....	10
1.2.1	Broad terms of reference .....	10
1.2.2	Interpretation of terms of reference .....	11
1.3	Process followed by the Committee .....	12
<b>2</b>	<b>The Socio-economic Context and the Need for Comprehensive Social Protection .....</b>	<b>15</b>
2.1	Introduction .....	15
2.2	Definition of socio-economic concepts .....	15
2.2.1	Poverty .....	15
2.2.2	Inequality .....	16
2.2.3	Unemployment .....	17
2.2.4	Social exclusion .....	17
2.2.5	Vulnerability .....	18
2.3	South Africa's demographic challenge .....	18
2.4	The structure of the labour force and the employment challenge .....	19
2.4.1	The extent of the problem .....	19
2.5	The apartheid labour-welfare nexus .....	21
2.5.1	Income distribution .....	21
2.5.2	Inequality at the end of the apartheid era .....	22
2.5.3	The importance of public transfers .....	24
2.5.4	Access to wage income .....	25
2.5.5	Wage inequality .....	26
2.6	Changes in inequality in the 1990s .....	26
2.6.1	Intra-racial inequalities .....	27
2.6.2	The growth/inequality debate .....	28
2.7	Poverty in South Africa .....	28
2.7.1	Recent evidence on poverty in South Africa .....	28
2.7.2	What is the level of poverty in South Africa? .....	28
2.8	Addressing the challenges of social security reform in a democratic South Africa .....	29
2.8.1	Inequalities in the distribution of wealth .....	29
2.8.2	Shortcomings in the South African social security system .....	30
2.9	The challenges .....	32

<b>3</b>	<b>Approach to a Comprehensive Social Security Provisioning .....</b>	<b>35</b>
3.1	Introduction .....	35
3.2	International trends in social security provisioning .....	36
3.2.1	Western Europe .....	36
3.2.2	The United States .....	37
3.2.3	South East Asia .....	37
3.2.4	Developing countries .....	37
3.3	Implications for South African context .....	37
3.3.1	Focus primary social security interventions on formally unemployed? .....	38
3.3.2	Workfare? .....	39
3.4	Defining an appropriate concept of comprehensive social security for South Africa .....	40
3.4.1	A comprehensive social protection “package” .....	41
3.4.2	Determining the “minimum” requirements for the CSP package .....	43
3.5	Economic, institutional and social mobilisation implications of comprehensive social protection .....	44
3.5.1	Social protection and the economy .....	44
3.5.2	Social protection and institutional arrangements .....	45
3.5.3	Incorporating social mobilisation into social protection .....	45
3.6	Social protection and private social insurance .....	46
3.6.1	Mandatory cover .....	46
3.6.2	Lower earnings limits for mandatory social insurance .....	46
3.6.3	Articulation and means tests .....	47
<b>4</b>	<b>Constitutional Framework for Social Security in South Africa .....</b>	<b>49</b>
4.1	Introduction .....	49
4.2	Status and impact of the Constitution .....	49
4.3	General principles .....	49
4.4	A human rights approach .....	49
4.5	The meaning of social security from a constitutional perspective .....	50
4.6	Limiting, interpreting and enforcing social security rights .....	51
4.7	Concluding remarks .....	52
<b>5</b>	<b>Poverty, Social Assistance Grants and the Basic Income Grant .....</b>	<b>55</b>
5.1	Introduction .....	55
5.2	Government programmes addressing poverty: findings .....	55
5.2.1	Poverty programmes to address capability and asset poverty .....	55
5.2.2	Poverty measures: requirement to target social policy .....	56
5.2.3	Government service delivery programmes .....	56
5.3	South Africa’s social assistance system .....	57
5.3.1	An overview of the social assistance system .....	58

5.4	The feasibility of a Basic Income Grant for South Africa .....	60
5.4.1	What is a Basic Income Grant? .....	61
5.4.2	Will the Basic Income Grant create dependency? .....	61
5.4.3	Will the Basic Income Grant target the poorest? .....	61
5.4.4	Can the Basic Income Grant be administered efficiently .....	61
5.5	The impact of a Basic Income Grant .....	62
5.6	Recommendations .....	62
5.6.1	Poverty measures and indicators .....	62
5.6.2	Basic Income Grant .....	62
5.6.3	A comprehensive and integrated medium- to long-term framework for income support .....	63
5.7	Conclusions .....	65
<b>6</b>	<b>Employment and Unemployment .....</b>	<b>69</b>
6.1	Introduction .....	69
6.1.1	Key issues .....	69
6.1.2	Implications for poverty .....	70
6.2	Recommendations .....	71
6.2.1	The appropriate form of social security .....	71
6.2.2	Social insurance: The UIF .....	71
6.2.3	Active labour market and job creation policies .....	73
6.2.4	Public work programmes .....	73
6.2.5	Informal social security .....	74
6.2.6	Institutional arrangements .....	74
6.2.7	Policy evaluation .....	75
<b>7</b>	<b>Protecting the Children .....</b>	<b>77</b>
7.1	Introduction .....	77
7.2	The Constitution .....	77
7.2.1	Constitutional obligations .....	77
7.2.2	International instruments .....	78
7.3	Evaluation of current policies towards children .....	78
7.3.1	Social assistance .....	78
7.4	Policy recommendations to address problems, gaps and inconsistencies of the current social security paradigm for children .....	81
7.4.1	Dealing with the special needs of children .....	81
7.5	Conclusion .....	83
<b>8</b>	<b>Health .....</b>	<b>85</b>
8.1	Introduction .....	85
8.2	Findings .....	85
8.2.1	Problems identified with the existing strategic framework .....	85
8.2.2	Role and scope of Government involvement .....	86
8.3	Recommendations .....	86
8.3.1	Reform strategy .....	86

8.4 Strategic financial framework .....	90
8.5 Coverage .....	90
8.6 Concluding remarks .....	91
<b>9 Retirement and Insurance .....</b>	<b>93</b>
9.1 Introduction .....	93
9.1.1 Coverage .....	93
9.1.2 Proposed strategic framework .....	93
9.2 Findings and recommendations .....	93
9.2.1 Compulsion and preservation .....	94
9.2.2 Administration .....	95
9.2.3 Retirement fund investment .....	95
9.2.4 Taxation of retirement funds .....	96
9.2.5 Defined benefit vs defined contribution .....	96
9.2.6 Consumer protection issues .....	97
9.2.7 Missing beneficiaries .....	98
9.2.8 State Old Age Pension .....	98
<b>10 Disability .....</b>	<b>101</b>
10.1 Introduction .....	101
10.2 The demographics of disability .....	101
10.2.1 The imperative to act .....	102
10.3 Findings .....	102
10.3.1 Conceptualisation and definition of disability and implications for national policy.....	102
10.3.2 Consequences of disability .....	102
10.3.3 Progress and gaps in the current framework .....	103
10.4. Integrating disability measures into social security .....	103
10.4.1 Fundamental principles and legislative framework.....	103
10.4.2 Concept of social security for disabled people .....	104
10.4.3 Definition of disability .....	104
10.4.4 Purposes and eligibility criteria .....	104
10.4.5 Assessment procedures .....	104
10.4.6 Targeting .....	104
10.4.7 Benefits .....	105
10.5 Short-term measures .....	105
10.6 Recommendations .....	105
<b>11 Road Accident Fund (RAF) .....</b>	<b>109</b>
11.1 Background .....	109
11.2 Conclusions .....	109
<b>12 Coverage Against Employment Injuries and Diseases ...</b>	<b>113</b>
12.1 Background .....	113
12.2 Fragmented statutory framework .....	113

12.3 Employee protection and interests .....	114
12.4 International standards .....	114
12.5 Prevention .....	114
12.6 Reintegration .....	114
12.7 Benefits .....	114
12.8 Exclusion .....	114
12.9 Commuting injuries .....	115
12.10 Defining accidents and diseases .....	115
12.11 Administration .....	115
12.12 Civil suits against employers .....	115
12.13 Financial issues .....	116
12.14 Conclusion .....	116
<b>13 Institutional Framework .....</b>	<b>119</b>
13.1 Introduction .....	119
13.2 Challenges .....	120
13.2.1 Overview .....	120
13.2.2 Public sector .....	120
13.2.3 Social insurance .....	121
13.2.4 Regulated private markets .....	121
13.2.5 Policy co – ordination .....	121
13.3 Recommendations .....	122
13.3.1 Integrated institutional and organisational framework .....	122
13.3.2 Social security board and agency .....	123
13.3.3 Governance structures for social insurance and related organisations .....	123
13.3.4 Social Protection Commission .....	123
13.3.5 Private sector regulation .....	123
13.3.6 Social security adjudication mechanism .....	123
<b>14 Financial Framework for Comprehensive Social Protection</b>	<b>127</b>
14.1 Introduction .....	127
14.2 Constitutional provisions affecting social security financing .....	127
14.3 An overview of South African social security financing .....	128
14.3.1 Determination of the allocation to the social sector functions .....	128
14.3.2 Budget prioritisation .....	128
14.3.3 Mixed financing principles .....	129
14.3.4 Allocation of the horizontal division .....	129
14.3.5 Medium-term Expenditure Framework .....	129
14.3.6 Conditional grants and special projects .....	129
14.3.7 Allocation of the vertical division .....	129
14.4 Key issues in social security financing .....	130
14.5 The existing framework for financing social security in South Africa .....	130

14.6 Overall allocations to social security .....	131
14.6.1 The budget framework and inter-governmental system .....	132
14.6.2 Sources of financing.....	133
14.6.3 Net burden of financing an income grant.....	134
14.7 The tax system and social security benefits .....	134
14.8 Review of the current tax dispensation .....	134
14.9 Review of principles underlying the classification and use of mixed financing options .....	134
14.9.1 General taxation .....	135
14.9.2 User charges .....	136
14.9.3 Consumer tariffs .....	138
14.9.4 Nominal levies and sundry revenue .....	139
14.9.5 Earmarked taxes.....	139
14.10 Generic financial framework for social security .....	141
14.10.1 Principles underpinning social security financial management .....	141
14.10.2 Recommendations .....	142
14.11 Social budget .....	143
14.11.1 Fiscal capacity and the prioritisation of social security expenditure .....	143
14.12 Reform proposals and their financial implications.....	146
14.12.1 Assumptions .....	146
14.12.2 Results.....	147
<b>15 Social Security Within a Regional Context .....</b>	<b>151</b>
15.1 Background .....	151
15.2 Regional implications for South Africa .....	151
15.3 Findings .....	152
<b>16 Conclusion.....</b>	<b>154</b>
<b>References .....</b>	<b>155</b>
<b>End Notes .....</b>	<b>158</b>

## Tables

<b>Table 1:</b> Declining incomes and growing inequality (1991–1996).....	17
<b>Table 2:</b> Unemployment in South Africa, (1996-2001) .....	20
<b>Table 3:</b> Employment (1 000s) in South Africa, (1996-2001) .....	20
<b>Table 4:</b> Racial income and population shares (1970–1996) .....	22
<b>Table 5:</b> The redistributive effects of public transfers (1993) .....	24
<b>Table 6:</b> Matrix of means and ends <sup>12</sup> .....	41
<b>Table 7:</b> Comprehensive social protection package and components .....	42
<b>Table 8:</b> Social impact of the Basic Income Grant .....	63
<b>Table 9:</b> Summary of coverage by broad income category .....	91
<b>Table 10:</b> Summary statistics on the retirement industry .....	96
<b>Table 11:</b> Summary of key issues affecting the operational and policy effectiveness of different	

organisational options within the social security system .....	120
<b>Table 12:</b> Financial estimate of the total expenditure within the South African social security system system .....	144
<b>Table 13:</b> Consolidated provincial and national expenditure from 2000/01 to 2003/04 (nominal prices) R' million .....	145
<b>Table 14:</b> Social security expenditure in 2015 if all the maximum scenarios evaluated by the Committee are implemented .....	147
<b>Table 15:</b> Social security systems in Southern Africa, a comparative assessment .....	152

## Figures

<b>Figure 1:</b> Framework for evaluating the social security system .....	12
<b>Figure 2:</b> Estimate of the South African population by age and gender (millions of people) .....	19
<b>Figure 3:</b> Income deciles by race, 1993 .....	23
<b>Figure 4:</b> Composition of household income, by income decile and source (%) .....	23
<b>Figure 5:</b> Participation rates and broad unemployment rates by income decile (1993).....	24
<b>Figure 6:</b> Employment per household by income decile .....	25
<b>Figure 7:</b> Shares of income by race (1970-1996) .....	27
<b>Figure 8:</b> Growth of household income by race (1991-1996) .....	27
<b>Figure 9:</b> Percentage of population in poverty .....	29
<b>Figure 10:</b> South Africa's distribution of income (assuming full take-up of existing social security programmes) .....	60
<b>Figure 11:</b> Distribution of income with a Basic Income Grant .....	63
<b>Figure 12:</b> Suggested phasing in of an income support grant system .....	65
<b>Figure 13:</b> Reform strategy and approximate timeline .....	87
<b>Figure 14:</b> Institutional framework for a universal contributory system .....	89
<b>Figure 15:</b> Strategic financial framework for the South African health system .....	90
<b>Figure 16:</b> Proposed strategic framework for retirement provision in South Africa .....	94
<b>Figure 17:</b> Recommended integrated organisational framework. ....	122
<b>Figure 18:</b> Proposed structure of a social security board and agency .....	123
<b>Figure 19:</b> Generic financial framework of a social security system .....	142
<b>Figure 20:</b> Social security expenditure in South Africa (estimates for 2001) .....	143
<b>Figure 21:</b> Consolidated provincial and national expenditure from 2001/02 to 2004/05 .....	145
<b>Figure 22:</b> Fiscal capacity over and above the existing MTEF with no negative macro-economic implications .....	146
<b>Figure 23:</b> Social security policy evaluation for the period 2001 to 2015 expenditure in constant 2001 prices .....	148
<b>Figure 24:</b> Social security policy evaluation for the period 2001 to 2015: expenditure expressed as a percentage of GDP .....	148